

CENTER FOR APPELLATE LITIGATION

120 WALL STREET - 28TH FLOOR, NEW YORK, NY 10005 TEL. (212) 577-2523 FAX 577-2535



ATTORNEY-IN-CHARGE
ROBERT S. DEAN
ASSISTANT ATTORNEY-IN-CHARGE
MARK W. ZENO
SENIOR SUPERVISING ATTORNEYS
ABIGAIL EVERETT
CLAUDIA S. TRUPP
BARBARA ZOLOT
MANAGING ATTORNEY
DAVID J. KLEM
SUPERVISING ATTORNEY
MARISA K. CABRERA
ASSISTANT MANAGING ATTORNEY
KATHARINE SKOLNICK

ATTORNEY-IN-CHARGE
ROBERT S. DEAN

(212) 577-2523 EXT. 502
rdean@cfal.org

MEMORANDUM

To: Chief Defender & Colleague
From: Bob Dean
Date: March 15, 2017
Subject: Attached

Here is a list of significant criminal cases pending in the New York Court of Appeals and the issues presented. Cases that the Court has selected for SSM consideration are generally not included. Leave grants were to the defendant unless otherwise noted.

The Center does this update every two months for its own attorney staff. As a matter of professional courtesy, we also send it to Chief Defenders who do substantial appellate work. Feel free to distribute copies to any members of your staff. This update is also available on our web site (www.appellate-litigation.org).

Although every attempt has been made to ensure the accuracy of the summaries, no express or implied guarantees are made. If your office is handling one or more of these cases and wishes to share some insight not apparent from the intermediate appellate court decision or the Clerk's summary of issues, please feel free to contact me. Your input will be added to the next edition.

We offer a special feature to our online visitors. Our online "Eye on Eagle" section (NYCA link) includes pdf links to all decided cases, and, for selected cases, a short CAL blog flagging what we think is important or noteworthy about the cases.

Happy reading!

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

**CRIMINAL CASES CURRENTLY PENDING IN
THE NEW YORK COURT OF APPEALS**

I. Cases Awaiting Decision

Matter of 381 Search Warrants Directed to Facebook v. New York County District Attorney's Office

AD1 order dated July 21, 2015, dismissing appeal from motion to quash subpoenas for customer accounts. Decision below: 132 AD 3d 11, 14 NYS3d 23. Court of Appeals granted leave December 16, 2015. Argued February 7, 2017.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether a social networking service (Facebook) that had been served with warrants for customer accounts has a constitutional or statutory right to challenge the alleged defective nature of the warrants on the customers' behalf prior to the execution of the warrants.

People v. Matthew A. Slocum

AD3 order dated November 12, 2015, reversing judgment of conviction. Decision below: 133 AD3d 972, 20 NYS3d 440. Fahey, J., granted leave to People March 2, 2016. Argued February 7, 2017.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Where the Public Defender's Office wrote a letter to the District Attorney, Sheriff's Office, and State Police stating that they represented the defendant, whether defendant unequivocally invoked his right to counsel prior to the commencement of formal proceedings by answering, "yeah, probably," to the question whether he thought he should have an attorney represent him prior to questioning. (2) Harmless error.

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

People v. Norman Whitehead, Jr.

AD3 order dated July 9, 2015, modifying judgment of conviction. Decision below: 130 AD3d 1142, 13 NYS3d 642. Pigott, J., granted leave November 24, 2015. Argued February 7, 2017.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Sufficiency of evidence of cocaine sale where the cocaine was unavailable for testing

People v. Richard M. Leonard

AD4 orders dated June 19, 2015 affirming judgment of conviction and denying 440 motion. Decision below: 129 AD3d 1592, 12 NYS3d 446. Lippman, Ch. J., granted leave December 29, 2015. Argued February 8, 2017.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Whether the IAC 440.10 motion should have been denied without a hearing because the trial counsel was deceased. (2) Whether counsel was ineffective because he failed to utilize prior inconsistent statements on cross, and failed to request a limiting instruction on Molineux evidence. (3) Whether the trial court improperly allowed evidence of defendant's prior uncharged sexual abuse of the victim, to establish intent and motive.

People v. Thomas Jackson

AD3 order dated May 14, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 128 AD3d 1181, 9 NYS3d 458, Lippman, Ch., J., granted leave December 28, 2015. Argued February 8, 2017.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Whether the court's erroneous Sandoval ruling that defendant could be cross-examined about a juvenile delinquency adjudication, which kept him off the stand, was harmless in light of the overwhelming proof of guilt. (2) The validity of the defendant's Antommarchi waiver. (Assigned counsel: Mitch Kessler, 63 Pike Creek Drive, Cohoes, NY 12047.)

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

People v. Charles Smith

AD2 order dated January 28, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 124 AD3d 918, 998 NYS2d 906. Pigott, J., granted leave November 9, 2015. Argued February 9, 2017.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether there was sufficient evidence of first-degree robbery - - did defendant “display” what appeared to be a firearm. During the robbery, the defendant kept one of his hands at his waist under a sweatshirt, but made no other action or gesture. (Assigned counsel: Skip Laisure & Lynn W.L. Fahey, Appellate Advocates, 111 John St., 9th Floor, NYC 10038.)

People v. Ryan P. Brahney

AD4 order dated March 20, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 126 AD3d 1286, 5 NYS3d 630. Lindley (AD dissenter), J., granted leave June 1, 2015. Argued February 9, 2017.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Consecutive versus concurrent sentences: Whether it was illegal to run defendant’s intentional murder and first-degree burglary sentences to run consecutively. (Assigned counsel: Kathryn Friedman, c/o The Sage Law Firm Group, PLLC, PO Box 200, 465 Grant Street, Buffalo, NY 14213.)

People v. Leonard Williams

AD2 order dated December 31, 2014, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 123 AD3d 1152, 997 NYS3d 499. Pigott, J., granted leave June 19, 2015. Argued February 14, 2017.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Whether the prosecutor’s use of a slide show powerpoint presentation during summation deprived defendant of a fair trial. (2) Whether the prosecutor mischaracterized the trial evidence on summation. (3) Whether counsel was ineffective for failing to object to the prosecutor’s summation comments. (Assigned counsel: Alex Donn and Lynn W.L. Fahey, Appellate Advocates, 111 John St., 9th Floor, NYC 10038.)

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

People v. Trevor Anderson

AD2 order dated July 29, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 130 AD3d 1055, 15 NYS3d 103. Pigott, J., granted leave February 25, 2016. Argued February 14, 2017.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) The trial court's Sandoval ruling allowing cross-examination about a gun possession conviction. (2) IAC for failing to object to the prosecutor's powerpoint presentation during summation. (Assigned counsel: Kathleen Whooley & Lynn W.L. Fahey, Appellate Advocates, 111 John St., 9th Floor, NYC 10038.)

People v. William Cook

AD2 order dated May 20, 2015, affirming a level three SORA designation. Decision below: 128 AD3d 927, 9 NYS3d 400. Court of Appeals granted leave October 20, 2015. Argued February 15, 2017. (Cross-Appeals)

ISSUE PRESENTED: (A) Whether the SORA hearing court erred in assessing 20 points under risk factor 7 for establishing or promoting a relationship with the victims for the primary purpose of victimization where defendant was a long-time family friend. (B) Whether courts can hold multiple SORA hearings for one offender in different counties for the same "current offense" - he pled guilty in two counties for crimes committed against the same children in co-ordinated prosecutions. (Assigned counsel: Lisa Napoli & Lynn W.L. Fahey, Appellate Advocates, 111 John St., 9th Floor, NYC 10038.)

People v. Yusuf Sparks

AD1 order dated October 15, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 132 AD3d 513, 17 NYS3d 423. Pigott, J., granted leave December 23, 2015. Argued February 15, 2017.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Whether the trial court erred in refusing to submit defendant's justification defense to the jury on the grounds of no "reasonable view." (2) The court's mid-trial change in its Sandoval

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

ruling. (Assigned counsel: Andrew Dalack & Robert S. Dean, Center for Appellate Litigation, 120 Wall Street, 28th Floor, NYC 10005.)

People v. Carlos Valentin

AD1 order dated May 7, 2015, reversing judgment of conviction. Decision below: 128 AD3d 428, 8 NYS3d 428. Saxe, J. (AD dissenter), granted leave to People October 15, 2015. Argued February 15, 2017.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1)Whether there was any evidence that defendant, who raised a justification defense, had acted as an “initial aggressor,” so as to justify the trial court’s initial aggressor charge. (2) Whether any error was harmless. (Assigned counsel for defendant: Robert S. Dean, Center for Appellate Litigation, 120 Wall Street, 28th Floor, NYC 10005.)

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

II. Cases Scheduled For Argument

People v. Shawn J. Silvertson

AD4 order dated June 12, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 129 AD3d 1467, 12 NYS 3d 402. Lippman, Ch. J., granted leave December 28, 2015. Originally argued January 3, 2017. Reargument ordered for March 22, 2017.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Search & Seizure: Whether the warrantless entry into defendant's apartment was justified by exigent circumstances where the subject weapon was a knife, not a gun. (2) Whether counsel was ineffective for failing to object to certain comments on the prosecutor's summation, including that defendant's silence upon arrest evidenced his guilt. (Assigned counsel: David C. Schopp, The Legal Aid Bureau of Buffalo, Inc., 237 Main St., Suite 1602, Buffalo, NY 14203.)

People v. John Stone

AD1 order dated October 30, 2014, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 121 AD3d 617, 995 NYS2d 68. Lippman, Ch. J., granted leave June 19, 2015. To be argued March 22, 2017.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Whether inferential hearsay testimony from a detective, that he started looking for defendant, the named suspect, after speaking to a non-testifying eyewitness, violated Crawford. (2) Whether under CPL 330.30(2), the trial court erroneously denied the motion to set aside the verdict based on juror misconduct without a hearing, even though there were disputed issues of fact. (Assigned counsel: Lisa A. Packard & Robert S. Dean, Center for Appellate Litigation, 120 Wall Street, 28th Floor, NYC 10005.)

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

People v. Omar A. Smalling

AD2 order dated March 11, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 126 AD3d 820, 4 NYS3d 307. Fahey, J., granted leave June 9, 2015. To be argued March 23, 2017.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether the trial court erred in giving a supplemental instruction regarding constructive possession of a weapon in response to a jury note. (Assigned counsel: Kathleen Whooley and Lynn W.L. Fahey, Appellate Advocates, 111 John St., 9th Floor, NYC 10038.)

People v. Jose Valentin

AD1 order dated October 15, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 132 AD3d 499, 17 NYS3d 424. Fahey, J., granted leave February 23, 2015. To be argued March 28, 2017.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Whether the People are allowed to introduce prior-drug-conviction evidence when a defendant asserts an agency defense by adopting portions of the People's case, rather than testifying or putting in defense evidence. (2) IAC for failing to object to the People's summation. (Assigned counsel: Richard M. Greenberg, Office of the Appellate Defender, 11 Park Place, Suite 1601, NYC 10007.)

People v. Everett B. McMillan

AD2 order dated July 1, 2015 affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 130 AD3d 651, 12 NYS3d 301. Stein, J., granted leave December 2, 2015. To be argued March 29, 2017.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Search & Seizure: After defendant was arrested inside a building on a parole warrant, whether the police properly searched his car based upon a tip received earlier in the day about a gun in the car; the defendant had signed an agreement when released on parole that any of his property could be searched. (2) Reverse-Batson: whether the trial court properly determined that defense counsel's reason for his peremptory strike, that he had no

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

information about the juror, was non-race-neutral and, if it was race-neutral, that it was pretextual. (Assigned counsel: Alex Donn & Lynn W.L. Fahey, Appellate Advocates, 111 John St., 9th Floor, NYC 10038.)

People v. Stanley Hardee

AD1 order dated January 22, 2013, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 126 AD3d 626, 5 NYS3d 430. Acosta, J. (AD dissenter), granted leave June 18, 2015. (Taken off SSM.) To be argued March 29, 2017.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether, under People v. Torres - - which allows police to conduct a protective search of a car only where the officers (1) have reasonable suspicion to believe a crime has been committed and (2) have an articulable basis to fear for their own safety - - police may search a car when the driver has committed a traffic infraction - - not a crime, there by failing to meet prong one of the Torres rule. (Assigned counsel: Rachel T. Goldberg & Robert S. Dean, Center for Appellate Litigation, 120 Wall Street, 28th Floor, NYC 10005.)

People v. Andrew R. Bushey

Erie County Court order dated October 15, 2015, reversing City Court's granting of motion to suppress and dismissing of the accusatory instrument. Pigott, J., granted leave January 25, 2016. To be argued March 29, 2017.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Search & Seizure: Whether County Court erred in determining that the plate check of defendant's vehicle and ensuing stop were lawful.

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

People v. Otis Boone

AD2 order dated June 24, 2015, affirming the judgment of conviction as modified. Decision below: 129 AD3d 1099, 11 NYS3d 687. Rivera, J., granted leave December 22, 2015. To be argued April 25, 2017.

ISSUE PRESENTED: The court's denial of the defense request to charge on cross-racial identification. (Assigned counsel: Leila Hull & Lynn W.L. Fahey, Appellate Advocates, 111 John St., 9th Floor, NYC 10038.)

People v. Chris Price

AD2 order dated April 15, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 127 AD3d 995, 4 NYS3d 924. Fahey, J., granted leave July 28, 2015. To be argued April 26, 2017.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Admitting into evidence a photograph posted on the defendant's web page four months prior to the robbery, showing him holding a gun similar to the one used in the robbery, even though the People did not establish that the photo was genuine, and the complainant did not confirm that the gun in the photo was the same one used in the robbery. (2) Sufficiency of the evidence as to ID. (Assigned counsel: Tammy Linn & Lynn W.L. Fahey, 111 John St., 9th Floor, NYC 10038.)

People v. Miguel Viruet

AD2 order dated August 26, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 131 AD3d 714, 15 NYS3d 447. Fahey, J., granted leave December 15, 2015. To be argued April 27, 2017.

ISSUE PRESENTED: The trial court's refusal to give defense an adverse inference charge with respect to a missing surveillance videotape. (Assigned counsel: Leila Hull & Lynn W.L. Fahey, Appellate Advocates, 111 John St., 9th Floor, NYC 10038.)

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

People v. Jamar Bethune

AD2 order dated July 22, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 130 A.D.3d 937, 12 NYS 3d 902. Fahey, J., granted leave November 13, 2015. To be argued April 27, 2017.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether the trial judge erred in failing to conduct a reconstruction hearing prior to settling the trial transcript by cleaning up the court's supplemental charge to the jury, without any explanation or basis for the change.

People v. Lawrence P. Frumusa

AD4 order dated December 31, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 134 AD3d 1503, 22 NYS3d 737. Lindley, J. (AD dissenter), granted leave March 18, 2016. To be argued May 3, 2017.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) The introduction into evidence under Molineux of a civil contempt order against defendant for non-criminal actions occurring after the charged crime, but relating to the crime at issue. (2) Limitation on cross-examination. (3) IAC. (4) Denial of request to adjourn sentencing to give newly retained counsel time to prepare. (Assigned counsel: Timothy P. Donaher, Monroe County Public Defender, 10 N. Fitzhugh St., Rochester, NY 14614)

People v. Nirun Honghirun

AD2 order dated November 25, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 133 AD3d 882, 20 NYS3d 409. Fahey, J., granted leave March 3, 2016. To be argued May 3, 2017.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether trial counsel was ineffective for not only failing to object to alleged "prompt outcry" testimony, but also eliciting that same damaging testimony on cross-examination. (Assigned counsel: Patricia Pazner & Lynn W.L. Fahey, Appellate Advocates, 111 John St., 9th Floor, NYC 10038.)

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

III. Cases Waiting to be Scheduled

People v. Charles Smith

AD2 order dated January 28, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 124 AD3d 918, 998 NYS2d 906. Pigott, J., granted leave November 9, 2015. To be argued February 9, 2017.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether there was sufficient evidence of first-degree robbery - - did defendant “display” what appeared to be a firearm. During the robbery, the defendant kept one of his hands at his waist under a sweatshirt, but made no other action or gesture. (Assigned counsel: Skip Laisure & Lynn W.L. Fahey, Appellate Advocates, 111 John St., 9th Floor, NYC 10038.)

People v. Ross Campbell

AD1 order dated September 29, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 131 A.D.3d 882, 16 NYS3d 548. Fahey, J., granted leave January 26, 2016.

ISSUE PRESENTED: In this sexual assault prosecution, whether trial counsel was ineffective in failing to challenge a juror who was the victim of sexual violence and acknowledged that she would find it difficult to serve. Counsel’s voir dire comments made it clear that both he and the court were confused about the juror’s reasons for seeking to be excused from the jury. (Assigned counsel: Abigail Everett & Robert S. Dean, Center for Appellate Litigation, 120 Wall Street, 28th Floor, NYC 10005.)

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

People v. John Andujar

AD1 order dated August 4, 2015, reversing dismissal of accusatory instrument. Decision below: 49 Misc.3d 36, 18 NYS3d 259. Fahey, J., granted leave December 16, 2015.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether VTL §397, prohibiting “equip[ing] a motor vehicle” with a radio receiver capable of receiving frequencies allocated for police, applies when such a device is carried in the driver’s clothing. (Assigned counsel: Seymour W. James, Jr., Legal Aid Society, Criminal Appeals Bureau, 199 Water St. NYC 10038.)

People v. Michael E. Prindle

AD4 order dated June 12, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 129 AD3d 1506, 11 NYS3d 383. Lippman, Ch. J., granted leave December 28, 2015.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether defendant’s sentence as a discretionary persistent felony offender violated Apprendi v. New Jersey (530 U.S. 466) and Alleyne v. U.S. (133 S.Ct. 2151). (Assigned counsel: Timothy P. Donaher, Monroe County Public Defender, 10 N. Fitzhugh St., Rochester NY 14614.)

People v. Sean Garvin

AD2 order dated July 1, 2015 affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 130 A.D.3d 644, 13 N.Y.S. 3d 215. Hall, J. (AD dissenter), granted leave December 9, 2015. (Taken off SSM.)

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Payton v. New York (445 U.S. 573); whether defendant was arrested inside his home without a warrant. (2) Whether defendant’s sentence as a discretionary persistent felony offender violates Apprendi. (Assigned counsel: Tammy Linn and Lynn W.L. Fahey, Appellate Advocates, 111 John St., 9th Floor, NYC 10038.)

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

People v. Phillip Wright

AD2 order dated December 23, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 134 AD3d 1059, 22 NYS3d 522. Fahey, J., granted leave April 5, 2016.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Whether the discretionary persistent felony offender adjudication violated Apprendi v. New Jersey. (2) The denial of for-cause challenges to three jurors. (Assigned counsel: Mark Vorkink & Lynn W.L. Fahey, Appellate Advocates, 111 John St., 9th Floor, NYC 10038)

People v. Peter Austin

AD1 order dated December 22, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 134 AD3d 559, 23 NYS3d 17. Gische, J. (AD dissenter), granted leave February 9, 2016.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether a court must provide a permissive adverse inference instruction when important evidence that was promptly requested by the defense and is in the custody of the People is destroyed as a result of a natural disaster or otherwise, and whether a court may sua sponte forbid defense counsel from commenting on the missing evidence in summation. (Assigned counsel: Mark W. Zeno & Robert S. Dean, Center for Appellate Litigation, 120 Wall Street, 28th Floor, NYC 10005.)

People v. James L. Carr

AD4 order dated May 1, 2015, affirming denial of CPL 440.10 motion. Decision below: 128 AD3d 1402, 8 NYS3d 527. Lippman, Ch. J., granted leave December 28, 2015.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether the 440 motion, based on lack of jurisdiction, was improperly denied, in that the People failed to seek leave to represent murder charges to a second grand jury in violation of CPL 190.75(3). (Assigned counsel: Evan M. Lumley, Cornell Mansion, 484 Delaware Ave., Buffalo, NY 14202.)

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

People v. Darrell Spencer

AD1 order dated January 26, 2016, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 135 A.D.3d 608, 24 NYS2d 48. Tom (AD dissenter), J., granted leave March 3, 2016.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Whether the court violated the controlling statute and appellant's jury rights by refusing to discharge, as grossly unqualified, a deliberating juror who unequivocally declared her inability to set aside her emotions and decide the case solely on the facts and the law. (2) Whether the court's denial of an intoxication charge lacked a lawful basis and requires reversal. (3) Whether appellant's warrantless arrest violated Payton v. New York. (Assigned counsel: Susan H. Salomon & Robert S. Dean, Center for Appellate Litigation, 120 Wall Street, 28th Floor, NYC 10005.)

People v. Lanze Mason

AD2 order dated October 14, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 132 AD3d 777, 17 NYS3d 768. Fahey, J., granted leave February 24, 2016.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Whether the trial court properly refused to charge justification by ruling, as a matter of law, that defendant's use of a glass bottle to strike the complainant in the face constituted deadly physical force. (2) Whether the court's comment to the prospective jurors that, if any juror were to be excused on the basis of difficulty with the English language they would be required to take a course in English, was a mode-of-proceedings error. (Assigned counsel: Shanda Sibley & Lynn W.L. Fahey, Appellate Advocates, 111 John St., 9th Floor, NYC 10038.)

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

People v. Mark Nonni

AD1 order dated November 5, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 135 AD3d 52, 20 NYS3d 345. Manzanet-Daniels, J. (AD dissenter), granted leave March 17, 2016. (SSM.)

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Did the court violate O’Rama when it failed to alert counsel to the contents of the substantive jury notes, either prior to bringing the jury in, or after. (2) Did the police, who were investigating a burglary report which contained no description of the suspect, have a “founded suspicion” that the defendant was involved in the burglary based merely on his presence near the burglary scene? Alternatively, did the police constitutionally search inside the defendant’s pocket after detaining him? (Assigned counsel: Matthew Bova & Robert S. Dean, Center for Appellate Litigation, 120 Wall Street, 28th Floor, NYC 10005.) (Leave also granted to co-defendant, Lawrence Parker.)

People v. Kevin M. Minemier

AD4 order dated December 31, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 134 AD3d 1551, 23 NYS3d 786. Stein, J., granted leave April 12, 2016.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Whether CPL §720.20(1) requires the sentencing court to not only expressly consider YO status for an eligible defendant, but also state its reasons for denying YO status. (2) Whether, under CPL §390.50, defendant was not entitled to disclosure of information contained in the last page of the PSR, on the ground that it was marked “confidential.”

People v. Vilma Bautista

AD1 order dated October 20, 2015, modifying a judgment of conviction. Decision below: 132 AD3d 523, 18 NYS3d 47. Pigott, J., granted leave April 5, 2016.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Prosecutorial misconduct on summation by misstating evidence. (2) Whether the notes of an interview with an

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

alleged co-conspirator constituted Brady material. (3) Whether the trial court's error in reading to the jury findings of fact of a foreign country was harmless error.

People v. Roberto Estremera

AD1 order dated December 29, 2015, affirming PRS resentence. Decision below: 134 A.D. 3d 655, 21 N.Y.S.3d 622. Fahey, J., granted leave April 6, 2016.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether the court erred in conducting a PRS Garner/Sparber resentencing in defendant's absence, even though the court let the original determinate sentence stand with no PRS. (Assigned counsel: Richard M. Greenberg, Office of the Appellate Defender, 11 Park Place, Suite 1601, NYC 10007.)

People v. David Lofton

AD4 order dated October 2, 2015, modifying the judgment of conviction. Decision below: 132 AD3d 1242, 17 NYS 3d 523. Abdus-Salaam, J., granted leave May 16, 2016.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether the sentencing court's statements satisfied the requirement (People v. Middlebrooks, 25 NY3d 516) that the court consider YO treatment.

People v. Brian Degraffenreid

AD1 order dated April 7, 2016, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 138 AD3d 456, 29 NYS3d 301. Tom, J. (AD dissenter), granted leave May 31, 2016. (SSM.)

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Whether defense counsel was ineffective for formulating the defense around videotape footage that he did not carefully review, and which, when viewed by the deliberating jury, fatally undercut the defense. (2) Whether the court's jury instructions on causation, by conflating distinct CJI instructions for homicide and assault, allowed the jury to find appellant guilty of first-degree manslaughter merely by finding that he caused physical or serious

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

physical injury. (Assigned counsel: Barbara Zolot & Robert S. Dean, Center for Appellate Litigation, 120 Wall Street, 28th Floor, NYC 10005.) (Leave also granted to co-defendant Elmer Castillo.)

People v. Brian Novak

Schenectady County Court order dated January 23, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Rivera, J., granted leave May 16, 2016

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Whether the judge who presided over the defendant's bench trial may sit on the panel that decides his appeal. (2) Whether a prosecutor's information may supercede a simplified traffic information. (3) More.

People v. Robert Perry

AD2 order dated April 6, 2016, affirming denial of CPL 440.30 motion for DNA testing without a hearing. Decision below: 138 AD3d 763, 27 NYS3d 888. DiFiore, Ch. J., granted leave June 16, 2016.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Whether defendant met the "reasonable probability" standard for DNA testing (CPL 440.30 [1-a]). (2) Whether the motion court may consider evidence outside of the trial record. (Assigned counsel: Seymour W. James, Jr., Legal Aid Society, Criminal Appeals Bureau, 199 Water St. NYC 10038.)

People v. Mario Arjune

AD2 order dated April 13, 2016, denying writ of error coram nobis to reinstate dismissed appeal based upon ineffective assistance of trial counsel. Decision below: 138 AD3d 877, 28 NYS3d 329. Fahey, J., granted leave July 13, 2016.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether a writ of error coram nobis, alleging ineffective assistance of counsel depriving a defendant of his right to appeal, lies against trial counsel for - - after filing a notice of appeal - - failing to advise his client about his right to appeal or explain how to get appellate counsel assigned, thus resulting in the eventual dismissal of the appeal for failure to prosecute. (Here, retained counsel filed a

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

notice of appeal on behalf of his intellectually disabled and now-indigent client, but did nothing more - he did not advise his client of his right to poor person relief or to counsel, nor explain how to go about obtaining either, and he did not advise him of the benefits of appealing and consequences of failing to do so. When the People moved to dismiss for failure to perfect, counsel neglected to take any action although he had been served with their motion and thus must have known the appeal would likely be dismissed.) (Assigned counsel for petitioner: Jenin Younes & Lynn W.L. Fahey, Appellate Advocates, 111 John St., 9th Floor, NYC 10038.)

People v. Albert Edward

AT1 order dated March 22, 2016, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 51 Misc. 3d 36, 29 NYS3d 82. DiFiore, Ch. J., granted leave July 13, 2016.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether the allegations in the accusatory instrument charging defendant with fourth-degree weapon possession (PL 265.01 [2]) (possession of a “dangerous knife” with intent to use unlawfully) were legally insufficient where defendant possessed a “box cutter” that he said he used on the train for protection. (Assigned counsel: Seymour James, Jr., Legal Aid Society, Criminal Appeals Bureau, 199 Water St. NYC 10038.)

People v. Mary Ann Grady Flores

Onondaga County Court order dated January 8, 2016, modifying judgment by reducing the sentence and otherwise affirming the judgment of conviction. Fahey, J., granted leave June 23, 2016.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) The order of protection (to stay away from a base commander) as predicate for criminal contempt charge against an anti-drone protestor on a driveway outside an air base, a training center for drone pilots. (2) Whether the court erred in responding to a jury question.

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

People v. Douglas McCain

AT2 order dated December 31, 2015, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 50 Misc. 3d 132(A), 2015 WL 9694118. Stein, J., granted leave August 5, 2016.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether the misdemeanor complaint was jurisdictionally defective, in charging PL 265.01 (2) (possession of a dangerous knife with intent to use unlawfully), when it alleged that defendant possessed a “razor knife” clipped to his pants pocket and told the arresting officer he possessed the knife “for protection”; the Appellate Term’s use of the presumption in PL 265.15 (4) to sustain the count.

People v. Michael Johnson

AD2 order dated May 18, 2016, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 139 AD3d 967, 34 NYS3d 62. Hall, J. (AD dissenter), granted leave August 5, 2016.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Whether the defendant’s post-arrest statements were voluntary, even though there was a 33-hour delay between arrest and arraignment, where the People produced no evidence that defendant was provided with food, water, or bathroom access during this period. (2) The denial of a missing witness charge as to the complainant’s son, an eyewitness. (3) The denial of a mistrial in response to improper testimony. (4) Delayed disclosure of Rosario material. (Assigned counsel: De Nice Powell & Lynn W.L. Fahey, Appellate Advocates, 111 John Street, 9th Floor, NYC 10038.)

People v. Dennis O’Kane

Albany County Court order dated September 14, 2015, reversing judgment of conviction. Abdus-Salaam, J., granted leave August 1, 2016.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Whether trial counsel was ineffective for consenting to annotations on the verdict sheet, resulting in reversible error. (2) Whether County Court properly reached the issue sua sponte.

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

People v. Marlo S. Helms

AD4 order dated July 8, 2016, modifying judgment by striking down defendant's sentence as a second felony offender and otherwise affirming. Decision below: 141 A.D.3d 1138, 35 NYS3d 817. Curran, J. (AD dissenter), granted leave to People August 10, 2016.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether the Appellate Division correctly held that defendant was not a second felony offender based upon a predicate Georgia burglary conviction in that the Georgia statute did not have the "knowing" scienter element in it. (Assigned counsel: Timothy P. Donaher, Monroe County Public Defender, 10 N. Fitzhugh St., Rochester, NY 14614.)

People v. Dwight Smith

AD1 order dated August 25, 2016, reversing judgment of conviction and dismissing the indictment with leave to re-present. Decision below: 143 AD3d 31, 37 NYS3d 4. Kapnick, J. (AD dissenter), granted leave to People September 29, 2016.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) The validity of the appeal waiver; (2) Whether the complete denial of the defendant's requests for a lawyer during pretrial proceedings concerning a DNA test violated defendant's right to counsel; (3) Dismissal of the indictment as the proper remedy. (Assigned counsel for defendant: Matthew Bova & Robert S. Dean, Center for Appellate Litigation, 120 Wall Street, 28th Floor, NYC 10005.)

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

People v. Jude Francis

AD1 order dated January 27, 2016, affirming SORA risk-level adjudication. Decision below: 137 AD3d 91, 25 NYS 3d 221. Court of Appeals granted leave June 9, 2016.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether a defendant's prior YO adjudication may be considered in determining the defendant's SORA risk-level designation. (Assigned counsel: Lynn W.L. Fahey, Appellate Advocates, 111 John St., 9th Floor, NYC 10038.)

People v. Leroy Savage Smith

AD4 order dated June 10, 2016, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 140 AD3d 1699, 32 NYS3d 538. DiFiore, Ch. J., granted leave September 6, 2016.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether a trial court may summarily deny a request for new counsel on the eve of trial, or must make a minimal inquiry under *People v Sides* (75 NY2d 822), where defendant alleges ineffective assistance of counsel as the basis for the substitution. Defendant said his attorney failed to contact any of the exculpatory witnesses he named or do any investigation into the assault where he claimed self-defense. Defendant also said that his attorney told him that there was no money to hire and investigator to do so, thus implicating *Hinton v Alabama* (571 US __; 134 S Ct 1081 [2014]). Despite such allegations, the Fourth Department, citing *People v Porto* (16 NY3d 93) found that Mr. Smith "failed to proffer specific allegations of a seemingly serious request that would require the court to engage in a minimal inquiry." (Assigned counsel: Philip Rothschild, Hiscock Legal Aid Society, 351 South Warren Street, Syracuse, NY 13202.)

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

People v. Kerri Roberts

AD1 order dated April 7, 2016, modifying judgment of conviction by vacating and dismissing identity theft conviction and otherwise affirming. Decision below: 138 AD3d 461, 29 NYS3d 305. Pigott, J., granted leave to People November 1, 2016.

ISSUE PRESENTED: The sufficiency of the evidence of identity theft, where the defendant used the victim's personal information, but did not assume her identity. (Assigned counsel for defendant: John Vang and Robert S. Dean, Center for Appellate Litigation, 120 Wall Street, 28th Floor, NYC 10005.)

People v. Joseph Sposito

AD3 order dated June 9, 2016, affirming judgment of conviction and denial of CPL 440.30 motion for DNA testing, but reversing denial of IAC-440.10 without a hearing. Decision below: 140 A.D.3d 1308, 32 NYS3d 736. Pigott, J., granted leave November 10, 2016.

ISSUES PRESENTED: (1) Whether trial counsel was ineffective for, inter alia, waiving a Huntley hearing without reviewing the confession. (2) Whether the motion for DNA testing was properly denied.

People v. Reginald Wiggins

AD1 order dated October 6, 2016, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 143 AD3d 451, 39 NYS3d 395. Moskowitz, J. (AD dissenter), granted leave January 3, 2017.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether the six-year pre-trial delay deprived the defendant, a teenager incarcerated since age 16 at Rikers Island, of his constitutional right to a speedy trial. (Assigned counsel: Ben Schatz & Robert S. Dean, Center for Appellate Litigation, 120 Wall Street, 28th Floor, NYC 10005.)

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

People v. Teri W.

AD1 order dated September 29, 2017, affirming judgment of conviction. Decision below: 142 AD3d 924, 37 NYS3d 890. DiFiore, Ch. J., granted leave December 30, 2016.

ISSUE PRESENTED: The defendant was adjudicated a youthful offender for first-degree sexual abuse. Whether the court properly imposed a 10-year term of probation rather than a 5-year term (see People v. Gray, 2 AD3d 275). (Assigned counsel: Seymour James, Jr., Legal Aid Society Criminal Appeals Bureau, 199 Water Street, NYC 10038.)

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation

IV. New Leave Grants

People v. Casmiro Reyes

AD2 order dated March 16, 2016, modifying judgment of conviction. Decision below: 137 AD3d 1060, 27 NYS3d 220. Garcia, J., granted leave to People January 25, 2017.

ISSUE PRESENTED: The sufficiency of the evidence of second-degree conspiracy. The Second Department held the evidence insufficient, even though the defendant was present at gang meetings where the plan to commit arson was discussed and knew the details of the plan. (Assigned counsel for the defendant: Seymour James, Jr., Legal Aid Society, Criminal Appeals Bureau, 199 Water St. NYC 10038.)

People v. Durville Small

AD1 order dated December 8, 2016, reversing judgment of conviction. Decisions below: 145 AD3d 478, 43 NYS3d 283. Webber, J. (AD dissenter), granted leave to People March 2, 2017.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether the trial judge erred in denying a challenge for cause to a juror who admitted that her prior experience would “probably” impact her ability to be fair. (Assigned counsel for defendant: Claudia S. Trupp and Robert S. Dean, Center for Appellate Litigation, 120 Wall Street, 28th Floor, NYC 10005.)

People v. Raymond Crespo

AD1 order dated November 10, 2016, reversing judgment of conviction. Decision below: 144 AD3d 461, 40 NYS3d 423. Stein, J., granted leave to People March 6, 2017.

ISSUE PRESENTED: Whether the trial court erred in summarily denying the defendant’s unequivocal requests to go pro se, just because they were made after the start of jury selection. (Assigned counsel for defendant: Ben Schatz and Robert S. Dean, Center for Appellate Litigation, 120 Wall Street, 28th Floor, NYC 10005.)

COURT OF APPEALS UPDATE - March 15, 2017
Center for Appellate Litigation
